

STAFF REPORT

THE CORPORATION OF THE TOWN OF COBOURG



Report to:	Mayor and Council Members	Priority:	<input type="checkbox"/> High <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Low
Submitted by:	Dave Johnson Planner II – Heritage Planning & Development Planning djohnson@cobourg.ca	Meeting Type:	Open Session <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Closed Session <input type="checkbox"/>
Meeting Date:	November 24, 2021		
Report No.:	HP-2021-038		
Submit comments to Council			

Subject/Title: Façade Improvements – 18 King Street East (Alonim Apartments Inc. / Andrew Smith Building Design Inc.)

RECOMMENDATION:

THAT Planning and Heritage staff has reviewed the proposed alterations at 18 King Street East and has determined that the proposal would constitute a compatible, incremental alteration to the existing facade of this modern building and would conform to the provisions of the Commercial Core Heritage Conservation District

FURTHER THAT Heritage Permit Application HP-2021-038 as submitted by Andrew Smith Building Design Inc. on behalf of Alonim Apartments Inc. to permit various alterations to the existing mixed-use building at 18 King Street East be approved, subject to the finalization of details with Planning and Heritage Staff.

1. STRATEGIC PLAN

Places: The Town protects, preserves, and promotes its natural assets, heritage, arts, culture and tourism.

2. PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT

The Cobourg Heritage Advisory Committee (CHC) operates in accordance with the Advisory Committee and Local Board Policy and Procedures for municipal boards and committees in the Town of Cobourg.

In general, the CHC is comprised of seven (7) members: one (1) member of Council and six (6) citizen members which reflect the diverse interests of the community.

The agenda for a CHC meeting is prepared and distributed to all committee members and is posted on the Municipal Website at least forty-eight (48) hours in advance of the scheduled meeting date, in an electronic format where possible.

Existing heritage legislation does not prescribe public notification or meetings for approval of alterations to designated properties, however the Cobourg Heritage Master Plan and implementing Heritage Conservation District Plans and associated regulations/guidelines underwent extensive public consultation and engagement prior to their approval. Review and approval of Heritage Permits by the Town are undertaken within the context of these documents.

The CHC also receives public delegations and communications/ correspondence from citizens in accordance with the Advisory Committee and Local Board Policy and Procedures for municipal boards and committees in the Town of Cobourg.

3. PURPOSE

To review and approve Heritage Permit Application HP-2021-038 for various alterations on a modern infill building at 18 King Street East in the Commercial Core Heritage Conservation District.

4. ORIGIN AND LEGISLATION

An application for a Heritage Permit was received on November 9th, 2021 from Andy Smith Building Design Inc. on behalf on Alonim Apartments Inc. to undertake a façade improvement at 18 King Street East.

The subject property is located in the Commercial Core Heritage Conservation District designated under Part V of the Ontario Heritage Act, and by By-law #27-90 as amended by By-law #118-91 and by By-law # 042-2016.

In accordance with the Ontario Heritage Act, the 90-day deadline for Council to deal with the application is February 7th, 2022.

Scope of Work

Façade Improvements – See Appendix 1 (A-F)

1. New Exterior cladding on front and rear façade of the building (Appendix 1-A & C)
 - a. Composite cement board (hardie board) vertical board and batten siding to replace the insulbrick
 - b. M23 – Bluebell Tavern grey green
2. New asphalt shingles – product from GAF Timberline. (Appendix 1-D)
 - a. Colour proposed to be charcoal

3. Roof shape will change slightly from a shed roof (one slope), front and back, to a multi-pitch roof (see Appendix 1-B) – sloping up slightly toward the back before sloping back toward the rear. Roof change to allow for proper insulation as well as new small loft in the upper apartment.
4. New entry door – Product from Andersen straightline series, 194 glass panel. (Appendix 1-B)
 - a. Aluminum clad solid wood door
 - b. Colour proposed to be T13 James Geddy Green
5. New windows on second and third floors – all windows 4'5" x 3'8" (Appendix 1-F)
 - a. Vinyl casement windows in white – from Vinyl Pro.
 - b. Covering up of 1 second floor window on the King St. E frontage.
 - c. Rear second and third floor windows to be changed – 6' x 4'
6. Exterior trim to be composite cement board (Hardie Trim). (Appendix 1-C)
 - a. NT3 Trim board smooth.
7. Currently vacant second and third floors to be completely renovated to provide two new residential apartments. (Appendix 1-B)



Figure 1: Subject property at 18 King St. E – showing full building clad with insulbrick.



Figure 2: Subject property at 18 King St. E – showing full building clad with insulbrick.



Figure 3: Subject property at 18 King St. E – showing second floor window.



Figure 4: Subject property at 18 King St. E – showing second floor window.



Figure 5: Subject property at 18 King St. E – showing third floor & loft window.



Figure 6: Subject property at 18 King St. E – showing third floor façade damage.



Figure 7: View of King St. E showing similar property across from 18 King St. E

5. BACKGROUND

The subject property is located at 18 King St. East on the north side of King Street East, and is designated under the Commercial Core HCD.



Above: The subject property is shown outlined in red within the context of the Commercial Core Heritage Conservation District (indicated in blue).

Historical and Architectural Context

Please see Appendix B – Heritage Property Report

6. ANALYSIS

The Town of Cobourg's Heritage Master Plan was adopted by Council in 2016 to direct conservation and management of the Town's heritage resources. As part of this project, the existing Heritage Conservation District guidelines for all of the Town's Heritage Conservation Districts designated under Part V of the Ontario Heritage Act were reviewed, and Heritage Conservation District Plans were prepared. The Commercial Core Heritage Conservation District Plan was adopted by By-law 042-2016 on May 24th, 2016.

The Plan contains policies and guidelines for conservation and the management of growth and change in the Commercial Core Heritage Conservation District. Policies are requirements that must be followed when undertaking alterations to buildings or changes to properties. Guidelines are best-practice suggestions to be considered when undertaking alterations to buildings or changes to properties.

The following section of this report provides excerpts from the East Heritage Conservation District Plan that are relevant to the evaluation of the proposed scope of work.

4.1 Storefronts and street-facing façades

Policies

- a) Maintain and repair, rather than replace, heritage material on existing storefronts that are physically sound and compatible with the overall building façade. Storefronts may have historic value even if they are later additions to the District.
- b) Building heights range from 2-3 storeys, and building roofs are generally flat, with some mansard and gable roof types. This building form at the street level shall be maintained.
- c) Contemporary modern designs are permitted provided they do not damage heritage building fabric and are complementary to the heritage building fabric in terms of materials, architectural details, size and location on the building.

Guidelines

- a) Existing storefronts may also be restored to an earlier period or style provided restoration is based upon historical documentation.
- b) Examine existing storefronts to determine if they are capable of revealing an earlier design and/or historic fabric beneath the present storefront which can be rehabilitated.

4.3 Roofs

Policies

- a) Original rooflines of buildings shall be maintained. Dormers and changes to rooflines may be permitted on a case by case basis where the proposed alteration is compatible with the character of the building.
- b) Decorative roof features and original/historic roofing materials, such as slate, wood shingles, and copper on sloped roofs, shall be retained and conserved. Replacement materials, if required, shall complement the original and/or historic materials.
- c) Ensure that vents, skylights and other new roof elements are placed out of view from the street and public rights-of-way.
- d) Roof drainage shall be maintained and directed away from building foundations.

Guideline

- a) The addition of solar panels may be permitted on roofs, but should not damage or remove heritage fabric. Solar panels should be installed in places that are generally out of view from the public realm.

Discussion

Prior to Council's adoption of the Commercial Core Heritage Conservation District (HCD) Plan in 2016, Heritage Permit applications were primarily evaluated against the Town of Cobourg's Heritage Conservation District Guidelines and Parks Canada's Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada. The Commercial Core Heritage Conservation District Plan provides the same level of heritage conservation using best practices as expressed in the Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada, while continuing with a similar management of future change and potential new development within the Commercial Core Heritage Conservation District Plan as the previous Heritage Conservation District guidelines. The Commercial Core Conservation District Plan is also consistent with the 2005 changes to the Ontario Heritage Act, the 2020 Provincial Policy Statement and the Ontario Heritage Toolkit.

The Commercial Core Heritage Conservation District is a cultural landscape that is characterized largely by its two and three storey commercial buildings built between 1840 and 1890. Robert Mikel identifies the diversity of architecture as a character-defining feature of the District. Any alteration to facade design and materials should be visually compatible with the neighbouring properties within the District. Exterior form and facade relationships play an important role in defining the streetscape in heritage districts especially in a downtown commercial core. Therefore, prior to making any changes to the exterior form and facade designs it is important to understand how the proposed changes may affect the setting of the historic place.

Pre-consultation with the applicant has been conducted electronically over the last couple of months.

Storefront/windows

The proponent intends to improve this building with new windows and new cladding. The new windows are proposed to be a vinyl product in white and the cladding is proposed to be hardie board in M23 Bluebell tavern grey green. The proposed hardie board cladding is intended to replace the very tired and unsympathetic insulbrick cladding.

It is noted in the Commercial Core HCD Plan modern materials are generally discouraged but they can be considered on a case-by-case basis. Given the context of this application, Heritage and Planning staff is comfortable recommending this incremental improvement over the existing conditions.

The upper floor windows are proposed to receive new treatments as part of this plan. Currently the windows are single glazed and feature wood frames. The new proposed units are to be double glazed and will be white vinyl.

It should be noted that this property had a heritage permit issued back in 2017 (HP-2017-007) to replace the windows with aluminum windows, and this property also received Downtown Cobourg Community Improvement Plan grant funding.

Though the windows were never changed, as the former owner passed after its issuance, thus the current application before us today.

Roof

The heritage permit application also proposes a modification to the roof form from. The existing roof, according to the permit application, is in very poor condition. The proposal is to change the form of the roof from a mono-slope roof to a composite slope roof that will slope slightly up toward the back, before sloping back toward the rear (please see Appendix 1B). The roof change will allow for proper insulation as well as clearance for a small loft in the third-floor apartment. Normally, staff would recommend against a roof change of this nature, however, the fact this building is currently negatively impacting the District, staff are of the opinion this alteration is appropriate given the context of this building.

According to my research and observations that this building is wood framed and clad with insulbrick and it does not exhibit significant built heritage value, as also noted in the Heritage Property Report prepared by Robert Mikel in the 1980s and is not contributing positively to the character of the Commercial Core Heritage Conservation District. Furthermore, a comparable infill building at 9 King Street East across the street is clad a similar board and batten metal cladding. Though the material is different, the style is similar enough that there is existing precedent for this type of alteration on King Street East. It is my opinion that the proposed alterations represent an incremental and sympathetic improvement to this building and therefore begin to contribute more positively to the District overall.

Based on my evaluation of the proposed improvements relative to the current state of the façade of the commercial and residential building and the approved policy context, it is my opinion that the proposal is an incremental and sympathetic upgrade to the existing building and will not detract from the heritage attributes of adjacent heritage buildings. In addition, the proposed façade design will distinguish itself from existing heritage buildings in the district.

7. FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS/BUDGET IMPACTS

N/A

8. CONCLUSION

The applicant's proposal for incremental alterations to the current commercial and residential structure (new cladding/windows/roof) conforms to the Commercial Core Heritage Conservation District Plan. When considering 18 King Street East, it is evident this is a modern building (construction date unknown) and must be evaluated in this context relative to the Commercial Core Heritage Conservation District Plan policies and guidelines. The incremental improvements/alterations that are proposed to the building's façade are positive in that it has the potential to breathe new life into the building. No heritage fabric

will be lost or covered in a modern material. Overall, it is my opinion that the applicant has satisfied the intent of the Commercial Core HCD Plan.