

STAFF REPORT

THE CORPORATION OF THE TOWN OF COBOURG



| | | | |
|--|---|----------------------|---|
| Report to: | Mayor and Council Members | Priority: | <input type="checkbox"/> High <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Low |
| Submitted by: | Dave Johnson Planner II – Heritage Planning and Development Planning djohnson@cobourg.ca | Meeting Type: | Open Session <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Closed Session <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Meeting Date: | April 7, 2021 | | |
| Report No.: | HP-2021-007 | | |
| Submit comments to Council | | | |

Subject/Title: New One Storey Rear and Side Addition with new mudroom – 121 Bagot Street – (Corlett) – follow-up/updated submission

RECOMMENDATION:

THAT Heritage and Planning staff has reviewed the proposed one storey side and rear addition and the conversion of a covered porch into a mudroom and has concluded that the proposal would be a compatible addition to the heritage structure and would conform to the West Heritage Conservation District Plan;

FURTHER THAT Heritage Permit Application HP-2021-007, submitted by Lee and Brad Corlett, be approved for a side and rear addition with mudroom at 121 Bagot Street, subject to the finalization of details by Heritage and Planning staff and the following condition:

- I. The conversion of the rear south-west window to a new door shall conserve the heritage decorative material and/or masonry work wherever possible.

1. STRATEGIC PLAN

Places: The Town protects, preserves and promotes its natural assets, heritage, arts, culture and tourism

2. PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT

The Cobourg Heritage Advisory Committee (CHC) operates in accordance with the Advisory Committee and Local Board Policy and Procedures for municipal boards and committees in the Town of Cobourg.

In general, the CHC is comprised of seven (7) members: one (1) member of Council and six (6) citizen members which reflect the diverse interests of the community.

The agenda for a CHC meeting is prepared and distributed to all committee members and is posted on the Municipal Website at least forty-eight (48) hours in advance of the scheduled meeting date, in an electronic format where possible.

Existing heritage legislation does not prescribe public notification or meetings for approval of alterations to designated properties, however the Cobourg Heritage Master Plan and implementing Heritage Conservation District Plans and associated regulations/guidelines underwent extensive public consultation and engagement prior to their approval. Review and approval of Heritage Permits by the Town are undertaken within the context of these documents.

The CHC also receives public delegations and communications/correspondence from citizens in accordance with the Advisory Committee and Local Board Policy and Procedures for municipal boards and committees in the Town of Cobourg.

3. PURPOSE

To review and provide a recommendation regarding Heritage Permit Application HP-2021-007 for a new one storey rear and side addition with a mudroom at 121 Bagot Street in the West Heritage Conservation District.

4. ORIGIN AND LEGISLATION

An application for a Heritage Permit was received on March 2, 2021 from Lee and Brad Corlett to undertake a new one storey rear and side addition and converting a covered porch into a mudroom at 121 Bagot Street. Following a meeting of the Cobourg Heritage Advisory Committee (CHC) on March 17, 2021 where the application was referred for further information, an updated resubmission was received on March 26, 2021.

The subject property is located in the West Heritage Conservation District and is designated under Part V of the Ontario Heritage Act, and by By-law #118-91 and By-law 044-2016.

In accordance with the Ontario Heritage Act, the 90-day deadline for Council to deal with the application is May 31st, 2021.

This report is to be read in conjunction with the original Heritage Staff Report considered by the CHC on March 17, 2021.

Proposed Scope of Work (Please see attached updated Appendix 1 A – E (elevations))

1. New 101 square metre (1095 square foot) one storey rear addition:
 - a. Roofing - New gable roof on half of the rear addition with black shingle and flat roof on the other half to allow a roof-top terrace. Roof on side addition (updated) to be a 1/12 slope roof in black shingle in order to not cover-up second floor window.
 - b. Cladding - Side, rear and mudroom cladding to be Maibec board and batten wood siding or Celect engineered siding. Colour to be white

on rear and north elevation addition; mudroom colour to be dark grey; existing painted main structure to change from yellow to white.

- c. Terrace - Roof top terrace of new addition will have white or black spindles or be glass. New rear second floor door to roof top terrace. Spiral stair case.
- d. Doors – See updated Appendix 2.
- e. Windows – See updated Appendix 2.



Figure 1: Existing conditions of 121 Bagot St. (front)



Figure 2: Existing conditions at rear of 121 Bagot – West facing and south facing



Figure 3: Existing conditions of rear at 121 Bagot St. – North facing wall

5. BACKGROUND

This report to be read in conjunction with report received by the CHC on March 17, 2021. A number of comments and questions were raised by the CHC at their previous meeting. This re-submission is intended to respond to them.

6. ANALYSIS

Pre-consultation was conducted by Planning and Heritage Staff with the applicant in November 2020 and on an on-going basis through the remainder of 2020 and beginning of 2021. During the meetings it has noted the applicants desire to create new living space for their future retirement home while respecting the existing built heritage of the dwelling. The applicants have been utilizing 121 Bagot as a weekend and summer retreat since 2013, and living in a heritage home appealed to them. The applicants note that in designing the side addition that is viewable from the street, attention was given to using appropriate cladding, ensuring the rhythm and design of the new windows does not detract from the existing heritage structure and to match the trim, mullions and colouring as closely as possible.

New One Storey Addition – See updated Appendix 1 (A – E)

The applicants are proposing to construct a new one storey rear and side addition and turning a covered side porch into a mudroom.

The new rear and side addition appear to be sympathetic yet distinguishable and clearly of its own time, which is in accordance with accepted heritage conservation principles and practices. Its design and massing respect the character of the existing heritage building, and the entirety of the roofline is lower than and subordinate to the existing structure. The roof of the side addition has been re-designed to a 1/12 slope in order to maintain the second storey north facing window.

The cladding proposed for the back and north addition is to be of white board and batten and the mudroom cladding will be dark grey. In effect, this will set itself apart from the existing heritage building and is reasonable given the addition is located at the rear of the building and will be largely hidden from the public street. However, the small portion that is visible to the street will be the same material as the rest of the addition. The roofing material, although modern black asphalt shingle, will be consistent with the primary building.

The new one storey addition will feature a new roof-top terrace, with a spiral staircase at the rear. The terrace will feature either black or white spindles or glass. The height of the railing will have to be Ontario Building Code compliant, as with the spacing of the spindles and be non-climbable. As a result of this new terrace, a rear second floor south-west window will be turned into a door entrance for the terrace that will be steel in white. Special care will be required to ensure that the decorative material and/or masonry is damaged or not adversely impacted by this task.

The proposal is to keep a symmetrical rhythm of windows on the new rear and side addition. There will be 11 new total windows:

1. Two (2) 36x60 double hung 6 over 6 lites pane white windows on front (east facing side). Material to be either wood, vinyl, wood with aluminum cladding on exterior or fiberglass. 1 window to be a bedroom window and 1 to be for new laundry room;
2. Windows on the south, west and north elevations to be black, double hung and 2 over 2 lites –
 - a. Four (4) 2 over 2 lites 24x48 windows on new south facing mudroom. Material to be either vinyl, wood with aluminum cladding or fiberglass;
 - b. Two (2) 2 over 2 lites 36x72 black in either vinyl, wood with aluminum cladding or fiberglass windows on rear west facing addition for the family room;
 - c. Two (2) 2 over 2 lites 48x18 black in either vinyl, wood with aluminum cladding or fiberglass window on north facing side addition for the bedroom and One (1) ensuite window

The fenestration on all elevations of the new side and rear addition will have respect for the heritage structure while also being clearly distinguishable of its time. It must be noted that there is no requirement for windows in the new addition to be wood. In fact, as noted above, new development is to be clearly distinguishable from old, and not attempt to replicate heritage in material or design. The existing south facing kitchen window at the covered porch on the south elevation and the north facing kitchen window will be maintained, and not removed or filled in as a result of the conversion to the mudroom and addition.

A new black steel colonial style door is proposed for the mudroom entrance. 3 slider patio doors off the family room (south & west elevation) in black vinyl, with aluminum cladding or fiberglass with 4 internal lites proposed for the rear addition. The front door of the main house is proposed to be restored.

In summary, the proposed one-storey rear and side addition and conversion of a covered porch into a mudroom offer a distinguishable built form that is complementary to the existing heritage building and does not appear to impose any negative impacts on the attributes of the heritage resources on the subject site or in the surrounding neighbourhood. In addition, the proposed rear and side addition meets the relevant policies and guidelines as set out in the West HCD Plan.

7. FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS/BUDGET IMPACTS

There are no foreseen financial implications on the Municipality as a result of this Heritage Permit application.

8. CONCLUSION

In conclusion, the proposed rear approximately 101 square metre (1,095 square foot) one storey addition and new side mudroom appear to have minimal impact

on the heritage features of the historic structure or on the character of the surrounding West Heritage Conservation District. It is the opinion of staff that the new addition and mudroom have been designed to be compatible with and distinguishable from the original heritage building while adding space and functionality to expand the residential use of the property. However, care must be taken to ensure the conversion of the rear window into a door does not damage any decorative or masonry work. Therefore, it is the opinion of staff that the proposal meets the policies as set out in the West Heritage Conservation District Plan, subject to the finalization of details by Planning and Heritage staff.